1.7.6 *Non-adoption of Model Prison Manual 2003*

For developing prison system in the country as an effective instrument for the reformation and rehabilitation of offenders, a Model Prison Manual, 2003 (MPM) was issued by the GoI with the aim to spell out minimum standards of institutional services for the care, protection, treatment, education, training and resocialisation of incarcerated offenders. Each State Government was required to formulate its own State Prison Manual on the lines indicated in this MPM, to adequately cater to the indigenous conditions, without diluting the concept of basic uniformity in law and procedure. During audit, it was noticed that the MPM was not formulated by the State Government even after lapse of more than a decade.

The above points were reported to the Government (August 2014); reply was awaited (December 2014).

MEDICAL EDUCATION DEPARTMENT

1.8 Irregular and avoidable expenditure

Government Medical College Haldwani irregularly incurred an avoidable expenditure of ₹ 58.62 lakh on outsourcing of services for reporting of MRI tests.

Uttarakhand Forest Hospital Trust, Haldwani (UFHT) signed an agreement (July 2006) with a New Delhi based firm (DCA, Radnet)[46] for outsourcing of services for reporting of critical cases of Computed Tomography Scans (CT scans) and Magnetic Resonance Imaging (MRI) tests conducted on its patients. The agreement was subsequently extended (September 2009) and is continuously being renewed since then even after conversion of the UFHT into a Government Medical College (GMC) by the State Government (May 2010). As per the Uttarakhand Procurement Rules 2008 (Rule-46), approval of the Administrative Department with the consultation of Finance Department of the Government is required in case of outsourcing of services by choice.

Audit scrutiny (June 2013) of the records of GMC, Haldwani showed that the outsourcing of services for reporting of MRI/CT scan cases to a specially chosen firm after the Medical College was brought into the Government fold in May 2010 was irregular as it was in contravention of the aforesaid provision. Further examination showed that a proposal to this effect was sent by the Medical College (July 2010) to its Administrative Department but no approval was granted by the Government. GMC had continued with the above arrangement. During the period May 2010 to January 2014, a total of 21,416 MRI cases of patients were carried out/forwarded to DCA, Radnet for reporting and an amount of ₹ 58.62 lakh had been paid by the GMC to the DCA, Radnet despite availability of four/five Radiologists competent for this purpose in the Medical College. Thus, had the services of the Radiologists available with the GMC been availed, the expenditure incurred by the GMC for outsourcing of reporting services could have been avoided.

---

[46] M/s Diwan Chand Radnet Services Private Limited, New Delhi.

While accepting the facts, the Government stated (December 2014) that instructions would be issued for executing a fresh agreement as per Uttarakhand Procurement Rules, 2008. It was also assured that a certain percentage of reporting of MRI tests would be conducted at the college itself.

MEDICAL, HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE DEPARTMENT

1.9 Idle expenditure

Medical equipment worth ₹ 60.52 lakh were not put to use for the benefit of patients and kept idle for periods ranging from six to eight years.

As provided by Rule 21 of General Financial Rules, 2005, any authorisation of expenditure from public funds is to be guided by the principles of propriety. Authorities empowered to incur expenditure are expected to enforce the same vigilance as a person of ordinary prudence would exercise in respect of his own money.

Scrutiny of records (August 2012) of the Chief Medical Superintendent (CMS), Base Hospital, Almora showed that five medical equipment worth ₹ 46.40 lakh[47] were received (between April and July 2006) in the hospital from the Director General, MH&FWD, Dehradun which were not put to use at all for the benefit of patients since their installation[48] and kept idle due to non-availability of technical staff in the hospital. Besides, it was also observed that two other machines worth ₹ 14.12 lakh[49] installed in the hospital remained non-functional after being used[50] up to 2008 due to non-availability of technical staff. Thus, idling of equipment for periods ranging from six to eight years indicates that the Department failed to establish required prudence in spending public money at every stage right from planning to utilisation, depriving patients of intended benefits, and calling into question, the planning process in the Department.

On this being pointed out, the CMS accepted (August 2012) the facts and stated (March 2013) that a request was being made with the Directorate, MH&FWD for creation of posts as well as for deployment of staff for operating these equipment. The reply itself indicated that equipment had been provided and installed in the Hospital without ensuring prior sanctioning of posts and deployment of required staff.

The matter was referred to the Government (March 2014); reply was awaited (December 2014).

[47] Dialysis Machine (₹ 10.85 lakh), RO Water Treatment plant (₹ 5.93 lakh), TUR Set (₹ 13.34 lakh), Bronchoscope (₹ 11.94 lakh) and Pure Tone Audiometer (₹ 4.34 lakh).

[48] Dialysis Machine (August 2006), RO Water Treatment Plant (February 2008), TUR set (May 2006), Bronchoscope (May 2006), and Pure Tone Audiometer (May 2006).

[49] TMT Machine (₹ 6.45 lakh)/ Date of Installation: 30.09.1998 and Endoscopy Machine with CCD Camera (₹ 7.67 lakh)/ Date of Installation: 13.08.1999/ 02.11.2000.

[50] (i) Endoscopy machine and CCD camera (up to April 2008) and (ii) TMT machine (up to August 2005).