

hospitals for all clusters, which forced the beneficiaries to move to other districts for availing treatment mainly for cancer, cardiac and paediatric. Seventy eight *per cent* of beneficiaries preferred to get treatment at private hospitals due to lack of adequate infrastructure and non-availability of specialist doctors in Government hospitals.

The department had not followed the enrolment procedure and opted for bulk printing of MA cards for BPLs already registered under RSBY scheme. These cards lacked vital information such as photographs, fingerprints, age, relationship, *etc.* which posed difficulties to the beneficiaries in getting immediate medical treatment.

Enrolment process at kiosks was also found deficient. Instances of non-monitoring of the work of TKE and authentication of the enrolment by TVA without verification of the records were also noticed. System to identify duplication in enrolment was not implemented which resulted in getting more than one active card by the beneficiaries.

Non-revision of financial limit available under scheme despite increase in package rates twice led to lesser benefits being available to beneficiaries. Instances of charging money by the empanelled hospitals were noticed which defeated very purpose of providing cashless treatment to the beneficiaries.

3.3.10.2 Recommendations

- *Anganwadi workers, Non-Government Organisations, Corporate Bodies located in the district or adjoining areas, etc. may be engaged for creating more awareness to achieve higher enrolment of beneficiaries especially BPL families in the scheme.*
- *Empanelment of more hospitals covering all clusters in the scheme may be explored besides improving medical facilities (infrastructure and specialist doctors) in the Government Hospitals to minimise movement of beneficiaries for treatment in other districts.*
- *Monitoring mechanism for enrolment process may be strengthened to ensure issuance of cards to the eligible beneficiaries under the scheme duly authenticated by the Competent Authority.*

3.4 Unfruitful expenditure of ₹ 1.59 crore

Trauma Care Centre established at a cost of ₹ 1.59 crore could not be put to use due to non-appointment of Medical and Para-Medical Staff.

The Government of India (GoI) launched (2007-08) a scheme for development of network of Trauma Care Centres (TCCs) all along the East-West and North-West corridors of Golden Quadrilateral of National Highways during 2007-12. The scheme envisaged construction of TCC buildings, development of manpower, purchase of equipment, establishment of life support ambulances and communication system. The trauma care network has been so envisaged that no trauma victim has to be transported for more than 50 kilometers (kms.) and a designated trauma care facility is available at every 100 km. The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (MOHFW) selected (October 2007 and August 2008)

12 hospitals⁶¹ in the State proposed by the State Government for up-gradation as TCCs at a cost of ₹ 91.55 crore.

GoI sanctioned (November 2008) a 14 bedded TCC in Referral Hospital and Community Health Centre (RH&CHC), Radhanpur, District Patan under the scheme. As per the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) signed (November 2007) between GoI and the State Government, the TCC was to be made operational immediately after March 2012. The construction of TCC Building of Radhanpur was completed (November 2012) by the Project Implementation Unit of Health and Family Welfare Department at a cost of ₹ 62.37 lakh and equipment worth ₹ 96.26 lakh⁶² were procured.

The State Government had sanctioned (June 2011) one post each of Orthopaedic surgeon and Anaesthetist, three posts of Medical Officer on fixed pay for 11 months on contractual basis and 24 posts of Para-Medical Staff and six posts of Housekeeping Staff on outsourcing basis. However, these posts have not been filled by the State Government as of April 2017 except for staff nurses and safai kamdars who have been posted on outsourcing basis from February 2016.

Audit observed that the TCC had not been put to use till April 2017 due to lack of Medical and Para-Medical staff. Scrutiny of records revealed that all accident/trauma cases were being referred to Gujarat Medical Education and Research Society (GMERS) Medical College and Hospital at Dharpur, Patan which was almost 77 kms. away from Radhanpur.

Audit further observed (April 2017) that the equipment procured have not been put to use except for 4D Doppler machine which has been given on loan (December 2012) to General Hospital, Gandhinagar. Of these, five ventilators procured (March 2009) at a cost of ₹ 56.71 lakh had not been installed for want of compressors and got damaged during the flood of July 2015, indicating negligent storage and upkeep by the officials of RH&CHC.

Failure on the part of the State Government to fill up the sanctioned posts of Medical and Para-Medical staff resulted in infructuous expenditure of ₹ 1.59 crore due to non-utilisation of TCC established since March 2011. This also resulted in failure to achieve the scheme objectives.

The Additional Director (Medical), Health & Medical Services, Gandhinagar accepted the facts and stated (April 2017) that despite conducting weekly interviews to fill the above vacant posts of Medical staff on fixed pay, no candidates had accepted the offer. The proposal to fill the vacant posts on ad-hoc basis for the present was under consideration. It was further stated that the ventilators had not been installed due to the supplier's failure to supply

61 **Seven Hospitals** at Bhachau, Bharuch, Himatnagar, Jetpur, Morbi, Porbandar and Radhanpur as **Level-II TCCs** and **five Hospitals** at Palanpur, Rajkot, Surat, Vadodara and Valsad as **Level-III TCCs**. **Level-II TCCs** shall have bed strength of 300 to 500 beds and provides definitive care for severe trauma patients with Emergency physicians, surgeons, orthopaedicians, anaesthetists in house and neurosurgeons and paediatricians on-call. **Level-III TCCs** shall have bed strength of 100 to 200 beds and provides initial evaluation, stabilization, comprehensive medical and surgical inpatient services with availability of emergency doctors (Physicians, surgeons, orthopaedician and anaesthetist) and nurses round the clock.

62 Procured by RH&CHC, Radhanpur, Patan – (1) C-Arm Image Intensifier (₹ 8.43 lakh), (2) 500 X-Ray Machine (₹ 5.34 lakh), (3) Operation Theatre Table Ortho (₹ 4.75 lakh), (4) Caultery Machine (₹ 2.87 lakh), (5) Operation Theatre Ceiling Light (₹ 15.37 lakh), (6) Suction machine Type-1 (₹ 0.19 lakh), (7) Medical Devices (₹ 0.27 lakh) and (8) X-Ray Accessories (₹ 0.95 lakh) and Supplied by M/s. Hindustan Aeronautics Limited.- (1) Anesthesia Machine with monitor 608 channel (₹ 1.38 lakh), (2) Ventilator High End – ICU (₹ 56.71 lakh), (3) Defibrillator with ECG monitor (value not provided), (4) 4D High end Colour Doppler (Value not provided) and (5) Multiparameter monitor (value not provided).

air-compressors for the ventilators. The reply is not tenable as equipment lying idle was brought to the notice of the State Government in the CAG's Audit Report for the year ended March 2012. Though more than five years have elapsed, no action has been taken by the State Government to operationalise the TCC, Radhanpur.

The matter was reported to the Government in June 2017. Reply is awaited (February 2018).

3.5 Irregular payment of ₹ 4.36 crore to agencies

Guru Gobind Singh Government Hospital, Jamnagar awarded contract of housekeeping services in contravention of State Government instructions which resulted in irregular payment of ₹ 4.36 crore to two agencies.

With a view to operate medical equipment, provide pathological/technical services to patients and provide administrative services in Government Hospitals, State Government decided to fill up vacant posts of Para-Medical, Administrative and Class-IV staff through outsourcing. The State Government prescribed (January 2007) terms and conditions for outsourcing housekeeping arrangements in the hospital campus against vacant sanctioned posts. The Additional Director, Health, Medical Services and Medical Education issued (July 2014) instructions to all the Medical Superintendents that the outsourcing should not be more than the vacant sanctioned posts.

Guru Gobind Singh Government Hospital (Hospital), Jamnagar invited (September 2014) e-tenders for outsourcing of housekeeping services (Class-IV staff) for the year 2014-15. Out of seven agencies⁶³ qualified for participation in the tender process, an agency⁶⁴ with the lowest bid (₹ 19.54 lakh per month for 323 personnel) was awarded (December 2014) the contract for a period of three months (January to March 2015) on trial basis which was further extended (April 2015) for three more months (up to 30 June 2015). Audit observed that the actual vacancy in Class-IV cadre was only 206. Therefore, the hospital should have awarded the contract for 206 personnel only instead of 323. It was also observed that the contract was entered into for number of personnel to be deployed without assessing the viability of the quotes. Audit analysis revealed that the price quoted by the L₁ bidder could not have met the minimum wages. This was also one of the grounds later cited by the hospital to terminate the contract in June 2015. Hence, the contract was *ab-initio* violative of the Gujarat Financial Rules and the Government instructions, which resulted in irregular payment of ₹ 1.17 crore.

Audit further observed (July 2016) that after termination of the contract in June 2015, instead of inviting fresh tenders, the Purchase Committee⁶⁵ of the hospital invited (June 2015) the remaining bidders for negotiation in violation of Central Vigilance Committee (CVC) guidelines. Three out of remaining six bidders (L₂, L₃ and L₆ agencies) refused to provide services at old prices. From the remaining three bidders, the Committee selected L₇ agency which had quoted a rate of ₹ 26.59 lakh for 299 personnel (₹ 8,892 per person per month) as against ₹ 23.70 lakh for 269 personnel and ₹ 22.92 lakh for 260 personnel quoted by L₄ and

63 L₁ - M/s. Bansi Enterprise, L₂ - M/s. Hanshil Enterprise, L₃ - M/s. Ravi Associates, L₄ - M/s. D. G. Nakrani, L₅ - M/s. Maruti Refrigeration, L₆ - M/s. J. K. Securities and L₇ - M/s. M. J. Solanki. Out of eight agencies technically qualified, M/s. Maha Gujarat Security Services, Bhavnagar had not furnished the price bid.

64 M/s. Bansi Enterprise, Rajkot

65 Head Clerk, Steward, Administrative Officer and Medical Superintendent were the constituents of the committee