

works. This indicated that the requirement of quantity of pipeline for the work in the original assessment was grossly underestimated. As a result, OHSRs constructed at a cost of ₹ 0.94 crore could not be commissioned and the possibility of their damage due to passage of time could not be ruled out.

GoR stated (December 2018) that due to non-availability of land at the proposed locations, the department decided to construct these OHSRs at other locations which led to increase in length of rising mains. It was also stated that the work would be completed by December 2018.

The reply is not tenable as department should have conducted proper survey and ensure availability of land before submitting the proposal for technical sanction but the same was not done by the authorities concerned. As a result, the department had to change the sites of OHSRs. Further, even after knowing the requirement of 6,600 meters pipes for rising main, the department took only 2,535 meter pipes for rising mains in Notice Inviting Tenders due to which the constructed OHSRs remained unconnected as of December 2018.

This resulted in non-commissioning of OHSRs for more than three years and rendered expenditure of ₹ 0.94 crore on these works unfruitful. Besides, the objective of providing 100 Liters Per Capita Per Day (LPCD) drinking water to the habitations of Zone 5 and 6 of Sardarshahar could not be achieved as they are getting only 30 LPCD drinking water since 2014.

Medical Education Department

3.4 Construction of Maternal Child Health unit caused damages to existing structure

Construction of Maternal Child Health unit above first floor of old hospital building without ensuring structural safety, resulted in structural damages to the whole building and unfruitful expenditure of ₹ 10.47 crore.

Construction of 100 bedded Maternal Child Health (MCH) unit at Government Pannadhaya Hospital (hospital), Udaipur (constituent hospital of Medical College, Udaipur) as a separate unit, was included in the State Programme Implementation Plan for 2012-13 under National Rural Health Mission (NRHM). Accordingly, Administrative sanction was issued by Mission Director, NRHM in June 2012 for construction of MCH unit having 7,095 square meter area. Financial Sanction for ₹ 15.27 crore was issued in August 2013, which was subsequently revised to ₹ 17.64 crore in January 2015.

Test check (February 2018 to March 2018) of records revealed that a departmental committee¹⁰ constituted in May 2012 recommended (October

¹⁰ Consisting of Principal, Medical College, Udaipur; Superintending Engineer, Medical & Health, Jodhpur; Senior Architect, Medical and Health, Jaipur; Executive Engineer, Medical and Health, Udaipur; Assistant Engineer, City Division, Public Works Department, Udaipur; and Assistant Engineer, Medical and Health, Udaipur.

2012) construction of MCH unit having 40,000 square feet area above the first floor of the existing hospital building¹¹. However, the committee also suggested that before carrying out the construction, a Structural Safety Certificate for the building should be obtained from the Public Works Department (PWD).

It was, however, observed that without obtaining Structural Safety Certificate from PWD, the Executive Engineer (EE) Medical and Health, Udaipur awarded (August 2013) the work to M/s Chirag Infraprojects Pvt. Limited for ₹ 4.23 crore with stipulated date of completion in February 2015. Meanwhile, another technical committee¹² noted (October 2013) that as the walls of the hospital were nearly sixty years old and was constructed with stone masonry and lime mortar, the normal load bearing capacity was only 30 to 35 feet. As the height of the building was more than 35 feet, the committee recommended that construction of an additional floor was not feasible. Later, as the contractor executed only 28.58 *per cent* (₹ 1.21 crore) of the work upto November 2014, the contract was rescinded (February 2015).

Without taking into account, the recommendations of both these committees (October 2012 and October 2013), EE awarded (June 2015) the remaining work to another contractor i.e. M/s Shailendra Sharma with stipulated date of completion as February 2016 who completed the work in April 2016 and handed over to the department in February 2017. The updated expenditure on the work was ₹ 10.47 crore.

Thereafter, severe horizontal cracks in the walls, lintels and roof were noticed in March 2017. Consequently, another technical committee¹³ was constituted (March 2017), which reported (March 2017) that cracks occurred due to increase in gravity loading by additional construction of second floor and was propagating in due course of time. These cracks further influenced the lintels and stone *patty* roofing of ground floor and led to an unsafe condition. The committee concluded that strengthening work of the floors was not executed before carrying out construction of MCH unit. Further, another committee headed by a professor of Malaviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur was designated (March 2017) by the State Government. The committee endorsed the finding of the earlier technical committee and suggested (May 2017) remedial measures for strengthening of the structure.

¹¹ Total area of the ground and first floor occupied by the hospital was 1,04,000 square feet.

¹² Consisting of Chief Architect, PWD, Jaipur; Additional Chief Engineer, PWD, Udaipur; Principal, Medical College, Udaipur; Superintendent, Maharana Bhupal Hospital, Udaipur; Superintending Engineer, PWD, Jaipur, two Associate Professors, Malviya National Institute of Technology, Jaipur and Executive Engineer, PWD, City Division, Udaipur.

¹³ Consisting of Additional Chief Engineer, PWD, Udaipur; Executive Engineer, PWD, City Division, Udaipur and Assistant Engineer, NRHM, Udaipur.



Horizontal cracks in the walls, lintels and roof of Government Pannadhaya Hospital, Udaipur

GoR while accepting the facts stated (July 2018) that the executing agency for construction of MCH unit was NRHM and the Structural Safety Certificate was not obtained by it before commencement of work inspite of the Assistant Engineer, Medical and Health, Udaipur being a member of the committee. Further, Principal & Controller, RNT Medical College, Udaipur at the behest (June 2018) of the District Collector, Udaipur has issued instruction to vacate the building keeping in view the safety of the public and transfer the medical services to other places.

Thus, haste in awarding of the work, initially by the EE before obtaining Structural Safety Certificate and later re-awarding the remaining work ignoring the recommendation of the committees for strengthening the existing structure before carrying the construction led to severe structural damages to the existing Government Pannadhaya Hospital building. Thus, before the entire building is utilised again, an additional expenditure would be needed for strengthening of the structure besides expenditure of ₹ 10.47 crore remaining unfruitful so far.

3.5 Unfruitful expenditure on Out Patient Department cum Emergency Block

Expenditure of ₹ 3.67 crore on construction of Out Patient Department cum Emergency Block remained unfruitful due to improper planning and leaving the incomplete structure of no use.

Construction of a new Out Patient Department (OPD) cum Emergency Block within one year, at Umaid Hospital, Jodhpur was decided (March 2012) in the budget speech 2012-13 to fulfil the urgent need of OPD patients as the existing OPD was not sufficient to meet the requirements of patients. Accordingly, Administrative and Financial (A&F) sanction¹⁴ and Technical Sanction¹⁵ were issued in June 2012 and November 2012 respectively for

¹⁴ Issued by Medical Education Department, Government of Rajasthan.

¹⁵ Issued by Additional Chief Engineer, PWD, Jodhpur.