

**PUBLIC HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE
DEPARTMENT**

3.3 Working of Indian System of Medicines and Homeopathy

Highlights

In Chhattisgarh, the Directorate of Indian System of Medicine and Homeopathy (ISM&H) has the responsibility of providing medical treatment through the systems of Ayurveda, Unani, Homeopathy, Yoga and Naturopathy. Poor infrastructure, high establishment cost and negligible expenditure on medical facilities were observed in audit. Financial and operational management of the Department were deficient. Thirteen to 58 per cent of funds allocated for purchase of medicines were not utilised. Pharmacy was not modernised and quality control of medicines was not ensured. Due to lack of infrastructural facilities, adequate health care facility was not being made available.

- Thirty bedded hospital at Ambikapur was not functional even after 25 years of sanction.

(Paragraph 3.3.6)

- Sixty one of the 63 buildings sanctioned in 2002 were incomplete till date.

(Paragraph 3.3.7)

- One hundred and forty eight dispensaries in six districts were running without doctors, and an unfruitful expenditure of Rs.4.73 crore was incurred on pay and allowances of para medical staff.

(Paragraph 3.3.8)

- The cost of medicines, produced during the period 2000-04 ranged from a meagre 17 per cent to 54 per cent of the overall running cost of the pharmacy.

(Paragraph 3.3.10)

- Pharmacy machinery worth Rs.80.21 lakh was either not received or not installed hampering strengthening and modernisation of the pharmacy.

(Paragraph 3.3.10)

- **Quality of teaching was adversely affected in Government Ayurvedic Medical College due to non-posting of eight professors, nine readers and 12 lecturers as required under the Central Council of Indian Medicine (CCIM) norms.**

Paragraph 3.3.11)

3.3.1 Introduction

The Directorate of Indian System of Medicine and Homeopathy (Directorate) is entrusted with the responsibility of providing medical treatment through Ayurvedic as well as other systems of medicine like Unani, Homeopathy, Yoga and Naturopathy. Provision of medical facilities, prevention of diseases, production, procurement and distribution of medicines, imparting medical education and training are the main objectives of the department. The department provides medical facilities through eight hospitals (six District Ayurvedic Hospitals, one Ayurvedic College Hospital and One District Homeopathy Hospital) and 690 dispensaries (632 Ayurvedic, Six Unani and 52 Homeopathic) in the State. There is also a Drug Testing Laboratory attached with the Ayurvedic pharmacy in the State.

3.3.2 Organisational set-up

At the Government level, the Secretary, Health heads the Department. The Director, Indian System of Medicine and Homeopathy (ISM&H), Raipur functioning under the Public Health and Family Welfare Department is the Apex field authority assisted by 16 District Ayurved Officers (DAO) who exercise control over hospitals and dispensaries functioning in the respective districts. One Government Ayurvedic Medical College engaged in imparting education and one Ayurvedic Pharmacy engaged in production of medicines are functioning under the Director.

3.3.3 Audit objectives

The main audit objectives were to assess:

- ❑ The extent and quality of service rendered by the department in promotion of good health through the ISM&H System.
- ❑ The quality and infrastructure for teaching and training available under the ISM&H.
- ❑ Mechanism for manufacture and quality control of drugs under ISM&H.

3.3.4 Audit coverage

The working of the Directorate for the period from the year 2000-01 to 2003-04 was reviewed during March-June 2004 through test check of records in the offices of eight DAOs³¹ out of 16. Information was also collected from the

³¹ Ambikapur, Dhamtari, Durg, Jagdalpur, Kanker, Korba, Raipur and Rajnandgaon

Directorate as well as the Ayurvedic College and Pharmacy, Raipur. The audit findings are discussed in the succeeding paragraphs.

3.3.5 Financial outlay and expenditure

The department incurs expenditure under the major Head 2210 Medical and Public health under grants No. 79, 80 and 41. The details of allotment and expenditure are given below:

<i>(Rupees in crore)</i>						
Year	Budget provision	Supplementary provision	Reappropriation	Total provision	Total expenditure	Excess (+) Saving (-)
2000-01	8.54	--	--	8.54	6.68	(-) 1.86
2001-02	23.57	2.32 ³²	--	25.89	20.91	(-) 4.98
2002-03	28.36	0.07	--	28.43	20.21	(-) 8.22
2003-04	26.97	3.04 ³²	(-) 5.17	24.84	24.69	(-) 0.15

Budgetary and financial control by the department was deficient as evident from:

- ❑ Budgetary proposals were made on incremental basis without receipt of monthly expenditure statements, detailed estimates and nominal rolls from the drawing and disbursing officers.
- ❑ Recourse to unnecessary supplementary grants of Rs.1.21 crore during 2001-02 and Rs.14.45 lakh during 2003-04 under grant number 79.
- ❑ Non-maintenance of expenditure control register by the Directorate to keep watch over progress of expenditure in sub units.
- ❑ Savings of Rs.15.21 crore during 2000 to 2004 under grants No. 79, 80 and 41.

The ISM&H was allotted only nine per cent of the total health budget of Rs.856.81 crore during the period 2001-04.

The ISM&H was allotted only nine *per cent* (Rs.79.16 crore) of the total health budget of Rs.856.81 crore while 91 *per cent* (Rs.777.65 crore) was allotted for Allopathy during the period 2001-04.

Pay, allowances and wages of staff ranged from 83 to 92 per cent of the total expenditure during 2001-04.

It was seen (**Appendix 3.3**) that the expenditure on pay, allowances and wages of staff ranged from 83 to 92 *per cent* of the total expenditure during 2001-02 to 2003-04. Expenditure on medicines and equipment ranged between four and 11 *per cent* during the same period. The quality of medical services was affected adversely due to negligible expenditure on medicines.

³² The provision of supplementary grant of Rs.1.21 crore of Rs.2.32 crore and Rs.14.45 lakh of Rs.3.04 crore was made unnecessarily.

Under utilisation of medicine budget*(Rupees in lakh)*

Year	Allotment	Expenditure	Surrender	Percentage of surrender of allotment
2000-01	35.77	27.71	08.06	23
2001-02	246.60	214.11	32.49	13
2002-03	232.02	143.05	88.97	38
2003-04	316.90	133.53	183.37	58

Thirteen per cent to 58 per cent of the budget allotment for purchase of medicines was not utilised during 2000-04.

As seen from the above table, 13 per cent to 58 per cent of the budget allotment for purchase of medicines was not utilised during 2000-01 to 2003-04. In reply, the Department stated that this was due to delay in supply of medicines by firms. The low use of medicines adversely affected the health care efforts.

3.3.6 Delivery of health services

There were six District Ayurvedic Hospitals in the State with a sanctioned bed strength of 180. Against this, the actual bed availability was only 95. Against available bed days of 1,00,375 the actual utilisation was 16,119 only that worked out to 16.05 per cent (**Appendix 3.4**).

An analysis of this data revealed the following:

Seventy five to 98 per cent bed capacities available in the six districts were not utilised during 2000-04.

Seventy five to 98 per cent bed capacity available in the six districts³³ were not utilised between 2000-01 and 2003-04. This was mainly due to poor clinical facilities, non-availability of medicines, shortage of nursing staff and absence of compounders etc.

Expenditure of Rs.19.76 lakh for the period 2001-04, on the pay and allowances on para medical staff and others engaged for in patients was infructuous.

Though a 30 bedded hospital was sanctioned in 1979 at Ambikapur the same was not functional till December 2004. Thus, an expenditure of Rs.19.76 lakh for the period 2001 to 2004 (December 2004) on the pay and allowances of nursing staff (3), ward boy (2), washerman (1), kitchen servant (1), cook (2) engaged for inpatients was infructuous.

The financial rules provide that store and stock accounts be prepared annually at the district as well as State level and physical verification conducted yearly. However, the stores and stock accounts were not prepared nor any physical verification conducted at any level. Absence of such a fundamental control left open the scope for misutilisation and pilferage of medicines. It was seen that medicines amounting to Rs.81,107 was issued to Balangi dispensary (District Ambikapur) vide voucher No.4 dated 26 June 03 and medicines worth Rs.51,290 were issued to Neelkanthpur dispensary (Ambikapur district) vide voucher No. 02/26 June 03 but they were not taken in the stock register of dispensaries as of December 2004.

³³

Ambikapur, Bilaspur, Durg, Dallirajhara (Durg), Jagdalpur, Raigarh & Raipur

It was further observed that the proper register, recording, receipts of medicines and their issuance were not maintained in all the dispensaries of Durg and Dhamtari districts.

3.3.7 Construction of dispensaries

Non-completion of 61 buildings compelled the Department to run 39 dispensaries in rented buildings.

The Government allotted Rs.2.38 crore to the Public Works Department (PWD) in December 2002 which was also drawn in 2002-03 for construction of 63 dispensary buildings to be completed within one year. Of these, only two dispensary buildings (Bastar District) could be completed (construction cost Rs.7.55 lakh) upto March 2004. Non-completion of 61 buildings compelled the Department to run 39 dispensaries in rented buildings. Thirteen dispensary buildings could not be started because of non-availability of land for construction and nine dispensaries were running in Janpad Panchayat buildings. The balance of Rs.2.30 crore was left with the PWD as of December 2004.

3.3.8 Non-posting of adequate staff

Twenty five per cent of the sanctioned posts remained vacant. There were 100 per cent vacancies in 29 categories (involving 68 posts).

Against 3,411 sanctioned posts as in July 2004, 844 posts (25 per cent) were vacant. There were 100 per cent vacancies in 29 categories. There were no Pathologists, Radiologists, Casualty Officers and Scientific Officers etc. against 68 sanctioned posts for these categories of specialists. Category wise vacancy position was as under:-

Category	Sanctioned Strength	Working Strength	Vacant post	Percentage of vacant posts
Medical	714	503	211	30
Para Medical	858	633	225	26
Others	1839	1431	408	22
Total	3411	2567	844	25

Thirty per cent of medical and 26 per cent para medical posts were vacant with consequent effect on quality of service rendered.

A large number of dispensaries in six districts were running without any doctor. However, an expenditure of Rs.4.73 crore was incurred on pay and allowances of para medical staff in these dispensaries during the period 2001-2004, as detailed below:

Dispensaries without any Doctor

Sl. No.	Name of district	Dispensaries without any doctor				Expenditure on support for the four years (Rs. in lakh)
		2000-01	2001-02	2002-03	2003-04	
1.	Raipur	--	27	28	29	68.05
2.	Dhamtari	12	12	11	11	50.48
3.	Jagdalpur	--	28	28	7	80.92
4.	Janjgir-Champa	29	30	27	32	102.84
5.	Durg	31	32	32	37	60.60
6.	Bilaspur	32	32	32	32	110.38
	Total	104	161	158	148	473.27

Further, it was noticed that in the Dhamtari district, four dispensaries³⁴ were running without deployment of regular medical and para-medical staff. However, part-time compounders in those four dispensaries were deployed for a day or two per week.

In 10 dispensaries in Champa-Janjgir district and seven dispensaries in Ambikapur only group 'D's (sweepers) were posted. Infructuous expenditure of Rs.14.79 lakh (2000-04) in Champa-Janjgir district and Rs.7.01 lakh (2000-2002) in Ambikapur district were incurred on the salary and wages of these group 'D' (sweepers).

It was, however, seen that no attempt was made by the Department to rationalise the posting of the paramedical and other staff from these dispensaries to the dispensaries which were actually functioning but had vacancies.

3.3.9 Lack of basic amenities in dispensaries

Scrutiny of records revealed that most of the dispensaries out of 690 were lacking in basic essential amenities like electricity (199), water connection (626), toilets (392) and residential accommodation (473) making the service rendered by them inadequate.

3.3.10 Production and quality control of drugs

The Department has one Ayurvedic Pharmacy at Raipur for manufacturing pure and reliable Ayurvedic medicines for supply to Government Hospitals and dispensaries. The Director was required to prepare a schedule for manufacture of medicines by the pharmacy. The Directorate did not fix any schedule or target for manufacture of medicines (2000-04), or keep the details of production nor monitored the working of the pharmacy.

Prohibitively higher cost of production in pharmacy

(Rupees in lakh)

Year	Operational cost	Cost of medicine produced	Cost of medicine as percentage of running cost
2000-01	62.37	17.64	28
2001-02	49.86	08.27	17
2002-03	60.04	28.64	48
2003-04	83.03	44.50	54

The cost of medicine produced during the period 2000-04 ranged from a meagre 17 per cent to 54 per cent of the running cost of the pharmacy.

The cost of medicines produced during the period 2000-04 ranged from a meagre 17 per cent to 54 per cent of the running cost of the pharmacy. Thus the operation of the pharmacy was not cost effective. The Department stated that due to shortage of machinery and equipment medicines could not be manufactured.

Non-testing of raw herbs and finished medicines in Drug Testing

³⁴

Barna, Fursia, Singpur and Umargaon

Laboratory (DTL).

The Drugs and Cosmetics Act, 1940, provides for testing and analysing Ayurvedic, Siddha and Unani drugs. The pharmacopoeial standards for ayurvedic formulations issued by the GOI lays down the extent and nature of tests to be conducted on the raw herbs and finished drugs.

A Drug Testing Laboratory was functioning at Raipur College to carry out quality control tests of raw herbs purchased as well as the finished products manufactured in the Pharmacy. The method of standardisation of products was to be as per monograph of Ayurvedic pharmacopoeia of India. No instructions were issued by the Director on functioning of the DTL.

Out of 250 samples of herbs and 686 samples of finished goods, only six samples were tested during 2000-04.

Scrutiny of records revealed that during 2000-04, while 250 samples of herbs and 686 samples of finished goods were required to be sent to DTL for testing, only six samples were tested. In the absence of tests by DTL the quality of raw herbs and finished products could not be assured.

The Department replied that there was no regular staff for testing of samples in the DTL and services of part time lecturers were utilised for test purposes.

Unfruitful expenditure on purchase of machinery

Government of India had provided Rs.1.25 crore in November 2000 for purchase of machinery for the pharmacy at Raipur.

Amount of Rs.1.25 crore provided by GOI in November 2000 for purchase of machinery not yet gainfully utilised (December 2004).

An advance payment of Rs.80.21 lakh was made (2003-04) to the Hospital Services Consultancy Corporation Limited, Noida, (UP) (HSCC) for purchase of machinery. Machinery worth Rs.40.04 lakh was received and installed, machinery worth Rs.28.32 lakh was received but not installed and machinery worth Rs.11.85 lakh was not supplied by the firm till December 2004. Even the installed machinery could not be put to use due to non-availability of trained operators. The department stated that some machinery were uninstalled due to non-availability of adequate buildings.

The reply of the department was an acceptance of faulty planning as trained operators and building availability were essential prerequisites that should have been ensured before orders for purchase of machinery were placed.

Infrastructure for education under the system

3.3.11 Functioning of Ayurvedic college Raipur

The Ayurvedic College and Hospital, Raipur imparts education in Ayurveda System of Medicines. The administrative control of the College is vested in the Secretary, Health Medical Education and Family Welfare Department, who is assisted by the Director, *Desi Chikitsa* and the Principal, Ayurvedic College.

The Central Council of Indian Medicine (CCIM) established under the Central Council of Indian Medicine Act 1970, prescribed standards with regard to teaching facilities, student bed ratio, number of Para Medical and non-Para

Medical staff and other necessary infrastructure for the colleges and attached hospitals. The standards were not followed as discussed below.

Student bed ratio below the norms

As against the norms, of 275 beds required for the 55 sanctioned seats of students, only 110 beds were available.

According to the norms prescribed by the CCIM, the student bed ratio should be 1:5. However, to begin with 1:3 bed ratio may also be acceptable and there should be at least 100 beds in a Hospital to start a new Ayurvedic College. As per these norms, 275 beds are required for the 55 sanctioned seats of students. The bare minimum requirement at the ratio of 1:3 is 165 beds. However, only 110 beds were available at the Ayurvedic College Hospital Raipur, which is below the norms. Due to shortage in bed strength, the quality of training given to students remained deficient.

Low bed occupancy in hospital

The occupancy of beds in the Hospital attached to the Ayurvedic college is shown below:

Name of College	Year	Beds available	Occupancy capacity in a year (Beds x 365)	Actual occupancy in a year	Percentage of actual occupancy
Government Ayurvedic College, Raipur	2000-01	110	40150	15184	38
	2001-02	110	40150	13753	34
	2002-03	110	40150	11613	29
	2003-04	110	40150	12541	31

The opportunity of practical experience was limited by low bed occupancy ranging from 29 to 38 per cent.

The table discloses that the bed occupancy was very low ranging between 29 per cent (2002-03) and 38 per cent (2000-01). This implied that the students had limited exposure to gain practical experience by treating patients.

Sub-standard diet to the patients

Quality of diet was not monitored and provided at very low cost due to non revision of rates from 1983.

The Public Health and Family Welfare Department (July 1983) had prescribed the cost per diet for indoor patients at Rs.8 per day. The scale and cost of diet were to be reviewed in 1988 but had not been reviewed as of July 2004. Thus, the diet cost of Rs.8 per day was a meagre amount in 2000-04 and the prescribed diet including milk, fruit, *gud* and ghee could have not been supplied at this rate. There was no system to check the protein and calorie content of the diet served to the patients and the quality of the cooked food was also not being tested.

The Department admitted that neither the protein and calorie content nor the quality of the cooked food served to the patients was tested. The rates have not been revised and diets were provided within the sanctioned cost.

The dietary needs of indoor patients remained totally neglected.

Inadequate teaching staff in college

In view of the acute shortage of teaching staff, quality of education imparted was affected adversely.

As per CCIM norm, 14 Professors, 14 Readers and 30 Lecturers were required whereas nine posts of Professor, 19 posts of Reader and 28 post of Lecturer were sanctioned. However only six professors, five Readers and 18 Lecturers were actually posted. In view of the acute shortage of teaching staff, the quality of education imparted was adversely affected.

Only five to seven seats were filled up against 20 seats in postgraduate classes.

During 2001-04, out of 20 seats in postgraduate classes, only five to seven seats were filled up every year. There was no admission during 2000-01. In view of the poor intake and lack of essential infrastructure and staff, the continuation of postgraduate classes required a review.

Shortage of medical and para medical staff

As per CCIM norm 176 posts of Medical, Para Medical and other category of staff were to be sanctioned for the Medical College. The State Government sanctioned only 75 posts against which 39 persons were actually in position affecting the quality of practical training and proper functioning of the Medical College Hospital.

Non-preservation and promotion of herbal garden

Even after lapse of seven years, no medicinal plants were planted thus denying the students of an important educational tool.

The Central Council of Indian Medicine has prescribed setting up of a Herbal Garden for Ayurvedic Colleges and attached Hospitals. This should be in proximity to the college and all possible medicinal plants should be grown in the Herbs Garden for identification and demonstration. The Government Ayurvedic College possesses 10 acre of land for the herbal garden. An amount of Rs.5 lakh was received from Central Government for development of garden on 25th August 1998. The expenditure was incurred on fencing, shaping of land and digging of water well. However, even after lapse of seven years no medicinal plants were planted, thus the very objective of having such herbal garden in the proximity of college and Hospital was defeated and denied the students of an important educational tool.

The department stated that no herbs were planted because no further grant was received from Government. Thus, the initial expenditure of Rs.5 lakh remained unfruitful due to lack of followup on developing the garden.

Non-functioning of X-Ray machine

Pay and allowances of Rs.7.57 lakh of two idle X-ray technicians was infructuous.

The sole X-Ray Machine in Ayurvedic College became non-functional in 1987 and was lying idle ever since and no new machine was installed. Two X-Ray technicians were drawing pay and allowances without any work. Thus, pay and allowances for the period 2001 to 2004 amounting to Rs.7.57 lakh was infructuous.

On being pointed out in audit the Department stated that matter was referred to the Government (May 2001) but reply is still awaited.

3.3.12 Internal control system

Out of the 18 units to be audited in a year only one unit was audited during the period 2001-04 by internal audit wing.

An Internal audit wing has been set up in the department for conducting the internal audit of field units. Out of the 18 units to be audited in a year only one unit was audited during the period 2001-04.

The Director stated that audit of units could not be completed due to shortage of staff.

Sixteen IRs containing 40 paragraphs involving an amount of Rs.11.30 crore were outstanding for compliance.

Of the Inspections Reports (IRs) issued by the Accountant General as at the end of the December 2003, 16 IRs containing 40 paragraphs involving an amount of Rs.11.30 crore relating to the Director and its subordinate offices were outstanding for compliance. This pendency was indicative of *lackadaisical* attitude towards settlement of outstanding observations on the part of the Director and its subordinate offices.

3.3.13 Conclusions

Despite the importance of promoting low cost and easily accessible treatment especially for the poor populace of Chhattisgarh, Indian Systems of Medicine and Homeopathy were languishing due to low allotment of funds as compared to allopathic system, shortage of staff, infrastructure and diagnostic facilities in various secondary/tertiary institutions and also inefficient functioning of the established facilities. The teaching and training facilities for ISM&H suffered due to low bed occupancies and inadequate staff. The production of drugs was very marginal and the testing of drugs so produced was also very low.

3.3.14 Recommendations

- ❑ The health care delivery system of ISM&H is suffering in several key areas due to inadequate funds; the State should consider a review of allocation of funds.
- ❑ The system of drug testing is languishing due to shortage of staff and equipment. The drug testing laboratory needs to be modernised to ensure effective quality control of drugs.
- ❑ Basic infrastructural facilities and staff may be ensured in all existing dispensaries/hospitals before sanctioning new ones.
- ❑ Fund allotted for construction of dispensary buildings should be optimally put to use and construction expedited.

Appendix 3.3

(Referred to in Paragraph 3.3.5)

STATEMENT SHOWING THE EXPENDITURE INCURRED ON PAY AND ALLOWANCES AND MEDICINES

(Rupees in lakh)

Year	2000-01		2001-02		2002-03		2003-04	
	<i>Expdt.</i>	<i>Percentage of total expenditure</i>	<i>Expdt</i>	<i>Percentage of total expenditure</i>	<i>Expdt</i>	<i>Percentage of total expenditure</i>	<i>Expdt</i>	<i>Percentage of total expenditure</i>
Pay & Allowance	636.11	92	1613.44	83	1647.44	87	1538.70	87
Medicine and Equipment	27.71	4	214.11	11	143.05	7	133.53	8
Others	30.77	4	114.46	6	117.11	6	90.95	5
Total	694.59		1942.01		1907.60		1763.18	

Appendix 3.4

(Referred to in Paragraph 3.3.6)

STATEMENT SHOWING THE POSITION OF CAPACITY SANCTIONED, AVAILABIE ETC. OF BEDS IN HOSPITALS

Sl.No.	Name of Hospital	Month/ year of sanction	Bed strength sanctioned	Beds available	Period (January- December)	Available bed days	Actual occupancy of bed	Unutilised capacity
(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)
1.	Ayurvedic Hospital, Jagdalpur	2/1983	30	20	2001-03	1095x20/ 21900	2662	88 <i>per cent</i>
2.	Ayurvedic Hospital, Durg	4/1980	30	30	2001-03	1095x30/ 32850	4803	85 <i>per cent</i>
3.	Ayurvedic Hospital, Dalli Rajahara	1/1985	30	05	Jan 2003- Dec 2003	365x5/ 1825	149	92 <i>per cent</i>
4.	Ayurvedic Hospital, Bilaspur	--	30	30	2001-03	1095x30/ 32850	8273	75 <i>per cent</i>
5.	Ayurvedic Hospital, Ambikapur	1979	30	NIL	--do--	1095x0/0	NIL	NIL
6.	Ayurvedic Hospital, Raigarh	2/1983	30	10	--do--	1095x10/ 10950	232	98 <i>per cent</i>
	Total		180	95		1,00,375	16,119 (16.05 per cent)	