

MEDICAL EDUCATION AND FAMILY WELFARE DEPARTMENT

3.4 INDIAN SYSTEM OF MEDICINE & HOMOEOPATHY

Highlights

The Government established the department of Indian System of Medicine and Homoeopathy (ISM&H) for making available doctors practising these systems of medicine and providing medical and health care services to the masses at an affordable price. The Department failed to provide adequate educational and research facilities in Indian System of Medicine and Homoeopathy (ISM&H). Medical and health care services were also poor in the State.

Ayurvedic, Unani and Homoeopathic Medical Colleges and hospitals did not fulfill the required standard prescribed by the Central Council of Indian Medicine and the Central Council of Homeopathy New Delhi in respect of deployment of teaching, non-teaching, medical and para medical staff.

(Paragraph 3.4.7)

In the Government Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, Muzaffarpur considerable number of students dropped out every year.

(Paragraph 3.4.7)

Functioning of the Ayurvedic College-cum-Hospital, Begusarai and the Government Tibbi College, Patna suffered due to lack of basic infrastructure facilities.

(Paragraph 3.4.8)

No patient was admitted in paediatric emergency and research department of Government Ayurvedic College hospital, Patna during 1999-2003.

(Paragraph 3.4.8)

Out of Rs 1.25 crore released by the GOI for strengthening of infrastructure in Ayurvedic & Unani Colleges / Pharmacies, expenditure of Rs 73.22 lakh incurred on the facilities was rendered unfruitful

(Paragraph 3.4.10)

The ISM&H department had not established any monitoring mechanism for evaluating the functioning of Ayurvedic, Homoeopathic and Unani colleges, hospitals and dispensaries.

(Paragraph 3.4.11)

Introduction

The Government established the department of Indian System of Medicine and Homoeopathy (ISM&H) for making available doctors practising these systems of medicine and providing medical and health care services to the masses at an affordable price in the State. These systems include Ayurveda, Siddha, Unani, Yoga, Naturopathy and Homoeopathy.

There are five Government Ayurvedic and one Unani and one Homoeopathic medical colleges / hospitals in the State. There is also one Ayurveda Post Graduate Department (Government Ayurvedic Medical College, Patna), one Ayurvedic and Unani Research Unit and one Ayurvedic and Unani Pharmacy. Institutions established for providing education and health care services under ISM&H are regulated by rules and instructions issued by the Central Council of Indian Medicine (CCIM) and the Central Council of Homoeopathy (CCH), New Delhi. There is a ten-bedded Government Homoeopathic Hospital, besides 69 ayurvedic, 30 unani and 28 homeopathic dispensaries in the State.

3.4.2 Programme objectives

The ISM&H department has been functioning for attainment of and propagation of these systems of medicine with the following objectives:

- Providing better educational and research facilities.
- Providing medical and health care services at an affordable price.
- Ensuring adequate infrastructure facilities.
- Developing herbal gardens for raw materials used in manufacture of medicines.

3.4.3 Organisational set-up

The ISM&H Department is headed by the Secretary, Health Education (Family Welfare), who is assisted by the Director and three Deputy Directors at the secretariat level. There are 27 District Indigenous Medical Officers (DIMOs) at the district level who are also in charge of Joint dispensaries at the district headquarters which had doctors of Ayurveda, Unani and Homoeopathy streams and State dispensaries (at the block level) which had a doctor of either Ayurveda or Unani or Homoeopathy stream.

3.4.4 Audit objectives

The main objectives of audit were to assess whether:

- Norms laid down by CCIM/CCH, New Delhi for running of medical colleges/hospitals were observed.
- Adequate infrastructure was provided to the ISM&H institutions for efficient delivery of services.
- Medical and health care services were provided to patients at an affordable price.
- Ayurvedic and unani medicines of required quality were produced for use in hospitals, etc.

3.4.5 Audit coverage

Performance of the three Ayurvedic Medical College-cum-Hospitals at Patna, Begusarai and Bhagalpur, Government Tibbi College (Unani) Patna, Ayurvedic Post Graduate Department Patna, Government Ayurveda and Unani Research Institute Patna, State Ayurvedic and Unani Pharmacy Patna, Rai Bahadur Tunkee Shah (RBTS) Government Homoeopathic Medical College-cum-Hospital, Muzaffarpur and eight¹ DIMOs for the period 1999-2004 was reviewed by test check of records during May 2004 to October 2004.

3.4.6 Financial outlay and expenditure

The position of budget allotment and expenditure during 1999-2004 was as under:

(Rupees in crore)

Year	Allotment	Expenditure	Saving
1999-2000	24.22	22.31	1.91
2000-2001	23.44	21.32	2.12
2001-2002	17.07	10.25	6.82
2002-2003	16.36	9.48	6.88
2003-2004	20.02	15.72	4.30
Total	101.11	79.08	22.03

(Source - Appropriation Accounts, Government of Bihar, 1999-2004)

3.4.7 Programme management

Government (Ayurvedic, Unani and Homeopathic) Medical Colleges in the State were to function as per the standards and regulations laid by the CCIM and CCH, New Delhi. Scrutiny of records revealed:

Shortage of teaching and non teaching staff

In none of the test-checked Ayurvedic, Unani and Homoeopathic Medical Colleges-cum-Hospitals, the strength of teaching and non-teaching staff was as per the norms prescribed by CCIM and CCH (**Appendix XXX & XXXI**). The number of men in position was less (Professors: 88 per cent, Readers : 76 per cent and Lecturers : 35 per cent) than the sanctioned strength.

No post of demonstrators in Ayurvedic medical colleges of the State

Against the requirement of 27 posts of Demonstrators in each Ayurvedic Medical College, no post had been sanctioned in any of the Ayurvedic Medical Colleges.

Post Graduate (PG) Department of the Government Ayurvedic Medical College, Patna is the sole institution in the State imparting post graduation courses in two disciplines namely "Dravyaguna" and "Ras Shastra". The CCIM, New Delhi after considering the available facilities of teaching,

¹ Begusarai, Muzaffarpur, Hazipur, Samastipur, Gaya, Aurangabad, Nawada and Biharsharif

practical training and infrastructure decided not to permit admission of students for the session 1997-98 and advised (September 1997) creation of independent hostel facility for boys and girls. In October 1998, however, the CCIM permitted admission of four students in each discipline with the condition to fill up the vacant posts of Professor (one) and Reader (one) and to establish a laboratory of P.G. standard in "Dravyaguna" and "Ras Shastra" within one year. However, these courses were continued without providing these facilities. In PG Department of the Ayurvedic college, Patna it was observed that admission of students for the session 2002-03 onwards was pending as confirmation in respect of number of seats reserved as per new Reservation Policy 2000 was awaited from the Government.

Lack of basic facilities in colleges / hospitals

Functioning of Ayurvedic College-cum-Hospital, Bhagalpur suffered due to lack of basic infrastructure facilities like electricity, equipment and shortage of beds. The CCIM, New Delhi had derecognised the college in 2001 due to non-functioning of the Indoor Patient Department (IPD). The IPD was still not functioning (March 2004).

Admission of students

Admission of students in medical colleges below the norms

Government Tibbi College, (Unani) Patna, the sole institute in the State for providing degree in Unani System of medicine, with enrollment capacity of 40 students, did not fulfill the minimum standard of three beds per student, separate hostel for boys and girls and herbal garden as fixed by CCIM, New Delhi. Despite these deficiencies, 106 students were admitted during 1999-2003.

Rajkiya Ayodhya Shivkumari Ayurveda Mahavidyalaya, Begusarai was permitted (August 2001) by CCIM, New Delhi to admit 30 students for BAMS degree course. Against the capacity of 30 students only 17 and 14 students were admitted in 2002-2003 and 2003-2004 respectively. Examinations for the sessions 2002-03 and 2003-04 were also not conducted. No reasons were furnished in this regard.

It was also observed in RBTS Government Homoeopathic Medical College-cum-Hospital, Muzaffarpur that students were not enrolled to the full capacity during 2003-04. Moreover, a substantial number of students dropped out every year as indicated in the table below.

High dropouts of students

<i>(In number)</i>			
Year	Sanctioned by CCH	Students admitted	Dropped out students
1999-2000	60	38	9
2000-2001	60	60	26
2001-2002	60	60	28
2002-2003	60	55	28
2003-2004	60	12	5

Shortage of teaching / non-teaching staff and inadequate infrastructure in the Colleges-cum-Hospitals contributed to shortfall in admission of students in the colleges and high drop-out rate.

3.4.8 *Functioning of Government Ayurvedic, Homoeopathic and Unani Hospitals*

The functioning of Ayurvedic, Homoeopathic and Unani Hospitals suffered from lack of medical / para-medical staff, poor infrastructure and non-availability of medicines as discussed below.

Shortage of staff

Shortage of medical/ para medical staff in the hospitals attached to Ayurvedic colleges

The functioning of three test checked Government Ayurvedic Colleges-cum-Hospitals² suffered due to non sanctioning / posting of Medical and para-Medical staff as tabulated below:

Post	CCIM norm	Sanctioned by Government	(In number)
			Men-in-Position
House Physician	30	Nil	Nil
Anaesthetist	3	Nil	Nil
Clinical Registrar	3	Nil	Nil
Casualty Officer	3	Nil	Nil
Assistant Matron	3	Nil	Nil
Nursing Sister	9	1	Nil

Consequently, no medical and health care services were rendered by these hospitals during 1999-200.

RBTS Government Homoeopathic Medical College and Hospital, Muzaffarpur was taken over by Bihar Government in 1981 and was recognised by CCH, New Delhi in 1999. The hospital attached to the college had a capacity of 60 beds. As per CCH norm one Deputy Medical Superintendent, four Resident Medical Officers and eight house staff were required to be posted in the hospital but the State Government did not sanction these posts (October 2004). No patient was admitted during 1999-2002 whereas only three and 20 patients were admitted during 2002-2003 and 2003-2004 respectively.

Poor infrastructural facilities in hospitals

Lack of infrastructure facilities in Ayurvedic College, Begusarai

The RBTS Government Ayurveda Hospital, Begusarai was functioning without the facility of "Panchkarma", X-ray, Operation Theatre, Delivery Room, Family Planning and Emergency child welfare unit. Dravyaguna and Ras Shastra Departments were functioning in a single room.

The hospital attached to the Government Tibbi College (Unani), Patna had the building in a dilapidated condition, no electric and water supply and was without bathroom and toilet facilities. The hospital was also without any operation theatre.

² *Government Ayurvedic College Hospital Patna, Begusarai: and Bhagalpur*

Indoor patients were not provided with essential facilities like bed sheets, pillow cover, mosquito net, mattress etc

Herbal garden was neglected due to lack of fund

All Ayurvedic Medical College and Hospitals were required to maintain a herbal garden for obtaining raw material for production of medicines as well as study of medicinal plants. It was observed that only the Ayurvedic Medical College, Patna had a three acre herbal garden which was not maintained due to lack of funds. Consequently, no raw material for preparation of medicines was obtained from the garden.

The laboratories for pharmacy of Unani and Ayurvedic medicines were non-functional. In PG Department of the Government Ayurvedic Hospital, Patna bed capacity was not utilized in full during 2000-03. No patient was admitted in the Paediatric, Emergency and Research Departments during 1999-2003.

Negligible expenditure on medicines

Despite availability of funds, most of the hospitals suffered from shortage of medicines and equipment due to their non-purchase as shown below:

Negligible expenditure on medicines and equipment

Name of institute	Years	Purpose of allotment	(Rupees in lakh)	
			Amount of allotment	Amount utilised
Government Ayurvedic College, Patna	2000-2001 to 2003-2004	Medicine machine & equipment	1.04 1.85	-
Ayurveda and Unani Medicine Manufacturing Unit	1999-2000 to 2002-2003	Raw material	6.40	0.88
	1999-2004	Machine & equipment	6.40	0.08
Post Graduate Deptt. Patna	1999-2000 to 2003-2004	Equipment medicine	2.28	0.41
			0.63	-
Ayurvedic and Unani Research Unit, Patna	1999-2000 to 2003-2004	Diet	1.06	-
		Medicine	1.50	0.30
		Equipment	2.32	-
Ayurvedic Medical College Hospital Begusarai	2001-2002 to 2003-2004	Machine equipment and Material	3.60	-
Total			27.08	1.67

The head of the PG Department stated that the meeting of the purchase committee under Chairmanship of District Magistrate could not be held to finalise the rates.

3.4.9 Functioning of dispensaries

Inadequate infrastructure facilities in dispensaries

District joint dispensaries (DJD) and the attached State dispensaries (SD) (sub-divisional level) were under the administrative control of DIMO. Seven District joint dispensaries and 32 State dispensaries out of eight DJD and 36 SD) test-checked in audit were running in private buildings. Only seven State dispensaries had the facility of electricity, nine were provided with water supply and three had toilet facility.

None of the dispensaries was provided with pathological, X-ray and indoor treatment facility. One Unani Dispensary in Muzaffarpur was running without Medical Officer since May 2001.

During 1999-04 out of Rs 10.29 crore, negligible funds (one per cent) were provided to dispensaries for medicine.

The State dispensaries had not maintained any record of the number of outdoor patients treated and details of medicines prescribed.

Shortage of staff and poor infrastructure led to poor functioning of the hospitals and dispensaries defeating the objective of providing medical and health care services to the masses.

3.4.10. Unfruitful expenditure on incomplete / unused infrastructure

Out of Rs 1.25 crore released by the GOI for strengthening of infrastructure in Ayurvedic & Unani Colleges / Pharmacies, expenditure of Rs 73.22 lakh incurred on the facilities was rendered unfruitful due to their non-completion / non-use, as detailed in the table below:

Sl No	Name of the Construction	Amount released (Rs in lakh)	Year of release	Expenditure incurred (Rs in lakh)	Remarks
1	State Ayurvedic & Unani Pharmacy, Patna	75.00	2000-01	25.00	Expenditure of Rs 25 lakh incurred on construction of the pharmacy building at Patna was unfruitful due to its non-completion for want of additional funds of Rs 5 lakh earmarked for it. Another Rs 50 lakh meant for purchase of machines and equipment for the pharmacy was lying unutilized.
2	Hostel building at Government Ayurvedic College, Patna	15.00	2000-01	15.00	The building was lying incomplete for want of additional funds of Rs 15 lakh
3	Hospital building for Government Tibbi College, Patna	10.00	1997-98	10.00	The building taken up for execution in November 2003 was lying incomplete due to paucity of funds.
4	Girls' hostel building in RBTS Homeopathic College, Muzaffarpur	15.00	2000-01	13.32	Hostel building completed in July 2003 was not put to use in the absence of security arrangements and non-fixation of rent by the Government. The balance of Rs 1.68 lakh was not refunded by the executing agency.
5	Computer lab, Government Ayurvedic College Patna	10.00	2001-02	9.90	The computer lab set up in July 2002 was lying unutilized in the absence of trained personnel.
	Total	125.00		73.22	

The balance of Rs 51.78 lakh was lying with the executing agencies.

3.4.11 Conclusions

The ISM&H department failed to provide education in ISM&H as the medical colleges lacked in basic infrastructure facilities and shortage of teaching and non-teaching staff. Medical and health care services in the hospitals were also

poor for want of medical and para medical staff, infrastructure facilities and medicines. Raw materials for preparation of medicines could not be obtained from the herbal gardens due to their non-maintenance.

Recommendations

- CCIM/CCH norms for providing infrastructure and manpower need to be followed.
- Adequate funds for medicines and equipment and other infrastructure in hospitals / dispensaries should be provided to improve the quality of health care services.
- Pharmacies and quality control system for Ayurvedic and Unani medicines need to be made functional.
- Proper monitoring systems need to be put in place for effective functioning of the ISM&H.

The points were referred to Government (November 2004); their reply had not been received (February 2005).

APPENDIX - XXX

(Refer : Paragraph – 3.4.7; Page 61)

Sanctioned strength and men-in-position of teaching staff of colleges

Name of College	Post	CCIM/CCH Norm	Sanctioned by Govt.	Men-in-position
Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna	Professor	12	10	1
Post Graduate Deptt., Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna		NA	1	NIL
Rajkiya Ayodhya Shivkumari Ayurveda Mahavidyalaya, Begusarai		12	10	NIL
S.Y.N.A. Ayurveda College Bhagalpur		12	1	NIL
Government Tibbi College, Patna		7	6	2
R.B.T.S. Govt. Homoeopathic Medical College Muzaffarpur		13	5	1
Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna	Reader	12	12	3
P.G. Deptt., Patna		NA	2	1
R.A.S. Ayurvedic College, Begusarai		12	12	1
S.Y.N.A. Ayurvedic College, Bhagalpur		12	2	1
Government Tibbi College, Patna		7	6	NIL
R.B.T.S. Government Homoeopathy. College, Muzaffarpur		15	4	3
Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna	Lecturer	21	28	28
P.G. Deptt., Patna		NA	3	3
RAS Ayurvedic College, Begusarai		21	48	14
S.Y.N.A. Ayurvedic College, Bhagalpur		21	10	6
Government Tibbi College, Patna		20	11	10
R.B.T.S. Government Homoeopathy College, Muzaffarpur		15	24	20

APPENDIX - XXXI

(Refer : Paragraph – 3.4.7; Page 61)

Sanctioned strength and men-in-position of Non-teaching staff of Colleges

Name of College	Post	CCIM/CCH Norm	Sanctioned by Govt.	Men-in-position
Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna	Lab Technician	15	8	1
RBTS Muzaffarpur		2	1	1
Government Tibbi College, Patna		4	3	3
Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna	Typist	13	3	3
RASA Begusarai		13	NIL	NIL
SYNA Bhagalpur		13	NIL	NIL
Government Tibbi College, Patna		7	1	1
RBTS Muzaffarpur		Not specified	1	1
Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna	Museum Keeper	9	4	3
RASA Begusarai		9	5	4
SYNA Bhagalpur		9	NIL	NIL
RBTS Muzaffarpur		Not specified	1	1
Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna	Peon	25	6	6
P.G. Deptt., Patna		NA	1	NIL
RASA Begusarai		25	29	19
SYNA Bhagalpur		25	9	4
Government Tibbi College, Patna		7	12	10
RBTS Muzaffarpur		Not specified	24	23
Govt. Ayurvedic College, Patna	Sweeper	6	7	2
P.G. Deptt., Patna		N.A	1	NIL
RASA Begusarai		6	6	1
SYNA Bhagalpur		6	3	2
Government Tibbi College, Patna		8	7	5
RBTS Muzaffarpur		Not specified	4	3